TRANS-URBAN-EU-CHINA
Transition towards urban sustainability through socially integrative cities in the EU and in China

Deliverable

D5.5 Urban Living Lab recommendations

WP 5 Living Labs, Exploitation & Dissemination
Deliverable type: Report
WP number and title: WP 5: Living Labs, Exploitation & Dissemination
Dissemination level: Public
Due date: Month 33 – 30 September 2020
Lead beneficiary: Norwegian University of Science and Technology (NTNU)
Lead author(s): Yu Wang, Nickolai Birkeland, Annemie Wyckmans (NTNU)
Reviewers: Stefanie Rößler (IOER)
Bernhard Müller (TUD)
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

ACRONYMS AND ABBREVIATIONS .................................................................................. 1
SUMMARY ....................................................................................................................... 2

1 INTRODUCTION ........................................................................................................... 2

1.1 SUCCESS CRITERIA FOR TRANS-URBAN-EU-CHINA LIVING LABS .................. 3
1.2 ACTIVITIES IN THE ULL CITIES ........................................................................... 4
1.3 THE URBAN LIVING LAB ACTIVITIES OVERVIEW .......................................... 5

2 SUCCESS CRITERION 1: LOCAL ANCHORING, ROBUST CONTACT AND EXISTING COOPERATION ........................................................................................................ 7

2.1 Scope ......................................................................................................................... 7
2.2 ANALYSIS OF ULL ACTIVITIES ............................................................................. 7
2.3 RECOMMENDATIONS .............................................................................................. 9

3 SUCCESS CRITERION 2: POTENTIAL FOR INTERACTION WITH LOCAL COMMUNITY .... 10

3.1 SCOPE ....................................................................................................................... 10
3.2 ANALYSIS OF ULL ACTIVITIES ........................................................................... 10
3.3 RECOMMENDATIONS ............................................................................................ 10

4 SUCCESS CRITERION 3: A STRONG ARCHITECTURAL OR URBAN ENVIRONMENT THAT CHARACTERIZES THE SPACE OF THE LIVING LAB ..................................................................... 11

4.1 SCOPE ....................................................................................................................... 11
4.1 ANALYSIS OF ULL ACTIVITIES ........................................................................... 11
4.3 RECOMMENDATIONS ............................................................................................ 12

5 CONCLUSION .............................................................................................................. 13
REFERENCES .................................................................................................................. 14
ACRONYMS AND ABBREVIATIONS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>AIT</th>
<th>Austrian Institute of Technology</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CAS</td>
<td>Chinese Academy of Sciences</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CAUPD</td>
<td>China Academy of Urban Planning and Design</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CCUD</td>
<td>China Center for Urban Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CIUC</td>
<td>China Intelligent Urbanization Collaboration Co-Creation Center for High Density Region</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EU</td>
<td>European Union</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EUCCC</td>
<td>European Union Chamber of Commerce in China</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IOER</td>
<td>Leibniz Institute of Ecological Urban and Regional Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ISINNOVA</td>
<td>Institute of Studies for the Integration of Systems</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NTNU</td>
<td>Norwegian University of Science and Technology</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>POLITO</td>
<td>Politecnico di Torino</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>THU</td>
<td>Tsinghua University</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TUD</td>
<td>Technische Universität Dresden</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WP</td>
<td>Work package</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WLSP</td>
<td>Wuhan Land Use and Spatial Planning Research Centre</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ULL</td>
<td>Urban Living Lab</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
SUMMARY

The report presents recommendations for using Urban Living Labs (ULLs) to support the creation of socially integrative cities in China, to promote changes in common practices and foster collaboration in the wider stakeholder community and with citizens and contribute to improved reciprocal knowledge on urbanization processes between the EU and China. Furthermore, it provides experience-based guidance on how to document the Living Lab outcomes, the experiences of the stakeholders and the performance of the various processes used, to enable learning by project partners and stakeholders, and to analyze the outcomes of the ULLs. In addition, the report includes additional feedback from the partners and stakeholders involved in the ULLs through additional interviews and storytelling.

1 INTRODUCTION

The Urban Living Lab in this project is defined as: “TRANS-URBAN-EU-CHINA will facilitate, coordinate and document the Living Labs in cooperation with WP 1-4, in order to discuss, test and validate their research frameworks and results. We will facilitate and coordinate workshops by WP 1-4 in the Living Labs, by using participatory design methods, scenario modelling, mock-ups, and storyboards, as well as methods and tools that support creative processes, e.g. future workshops, brainstorming, and experience prototyping. In addition, we will test transferability and scalability of the workshop outcomes towards fully functioning innovations with respect to optimal performance, stakeholder needs, and business models. This work will document the Living Lab outcomes, the experiences of the stakeholders and the performance of the various processes used, to enable learning by project partners and stakeholders.” (TRANS-URBAN-EU-CHINA 2018) Undertaking that thoughts, we have established 5 TRANS-URRBAN Living Labs as:

Chengdu (Wenjiang)

The Wenjiang district is one of the 11 districts of Chengdu, the capital city of the Sichuan province. Wenjiang is located at the west of Chengdu and used to be an independent county in the municipality of Chengdu. Wenjiang aims to become a high-quality liveable city. In recent years, it has explored a reform on neighbourhood level governance and has experimented with involving local communities and other local stakeholders to join the management of the community. TRANS-URBAN-EU-CHINA partner Tsinghua University co-hosted an international conference on community building in Wenjiang in August 2019 and invited several project partners to join the event. This gave the TRANS-URBAN-EU-CHINA team the opportunity to observe and participate in the local practice of government-initiated multi-stakeholder community building.

Jingdezhen

Jingdezhen is a prefecture-level city in North-Eastern Jiangxi province known as the "Porcelain Capital" because it has been producing pottery for 1,700 years, and the city has a well-documented history that stretches back over 2,000 years. The TRANS-URBAN-EU-CHINA team has organised two workshops with the local and regional authorities in Jingdezhen coordinated by CAUPD.

Tianjin

Tianjin is a coastal metropolis in northern China and one of the nine national central cities of China. In terms of urban population, Tianjin is the fourth largest city in China, after Shanghai, Beijing, and Guangzhou. Tianjin became TRANS-URBAN-EU-CHINA’s Urban Living Lab in May 2018, with an official launch ceremony during the 2018 EU-China Forum on Sustainable Urban Development. TRANS-
URBAN-EU-CHINA experts had a joint workshop with local stakeholders from the Tianjin Free Trade Zone on how to develop the area into a more liveable and mixed-use physical environment in which people would want to live, not only work. The workshop in May 2020 was cancelled due to COVID-19.

**Wuhan**

Wuhan is the capital of Hubei province, and one of the nine National Central Cities1 of China. Wuhan is recognized as the political, economic, financial, cultural, educational and transportation centre of central China. Wuhan counts 88 higher educational institutions, which makes it a leading educational hub for China and the world largest city in enrolled college students. TRANS-URBAN-EU-CHINA partners have made a series of ULL activities in Wuhan involving different stakeholders since 2018. Through those chain of events the project is able to share the results of the project with stakeholders and gain the feedbacks from Wuhan which will help TRANS-URBAN-EU-CHINA to validate its result in the context of China’s urbanization.

**Xiong’an**

The Xiong’an New Area is a state-level new area about 100 kilometres southwest of Beijing in the Baoding area of Hebei province. Established in April 2017, its main functions will be to serve as a development hub for the Beijing-Tianjin-Hebei (Jingjinji) economic triangle as well as becoming the new host for non-capital functions that are currently situated in Beijing. The China Academy for Urban Planning and Design (CAUPD) is responsible for developing the Master Plan for the Xiong’an New Area and is working on designing its digital planning platform. With TRANS-URBAN-EU-CHINA partner CAUPD being in a central role regarding the development of the Xiong’an area, this area was proposed as an extra-ordinary Living Lab for the TRANS-URBAN-EU-CHINA project. (TRANS-URBAN-EU-CHINA 2019)

This work stands upon the previous Deliverable D5.3” Urban Living Lab knowledge base and transformative knowledge”. While D5.3 described the activities performed in the TRANS-URBAN Living Labs, in D5.5 we aim to provide the learnings and recommendations based on these activities. At the onset of the TRANS-URBAN-EU-CHINA project, we co-created success criteria for the Urban Living Labs together with our partners and stakeholders. In D5.5, we reflected on those criteria in the ULL practice from the past 3 years, how these were affected by COVID-19 restrictions, and which unexpected factors emerged during the practice. In the end the remodified success criteria can be labeled as ULL recommendations.

### 1.1 SUCCESS CRITERIA FOR TRANS-URBAN-EU-CHINA LIVING LABS

During the initial stage of the project, Work Package 5 “Living Labs, exploitation and dissemination” mainly focused on preparing the future activities in Urban Living Labs in China. At that stage, one of the key outcomes was to define success criteria for TRANS-URBAN Living Labs. The criteria rest on the joint TRANS-URBAN partner workshop on Urban Living Labs (Dresden), the EU-China experts workshop on Urban Living Labs (Beijing)1 and desktop studies of existing Urban Living Labs across Europe and China. Based on these sources, we identified the following success criteria for TRANS-URBAN Living Labs.

- Potential for local anchoring, robust contact and existing cooperation between Chinese partners of TRANS-URBAN-EU-CHINA and local authorities and other urban decision makers in the local ecosystem, with broad approval and support of local government or municipality. This will help to build trust and increase TRANS-URBAN’s chances of getting involved in real-life urban

---

1 TRANS-URBAN partner workshop was taken place on 23rd Jan 2018 in Dresden which was one part of the program of TRANS-URBAN kick-off meeting. Eu-China experts workshop on urban Living Lab was co-organised with JPI Urban Europe in Beijing on 4 September 2018.
transition projects. Building on existing cooperation will help TRANS-URBAN-EU-CHINA to establish the living labs and harvest results during the short project period (3 years). This will also help the project to establish a part-time local presence in the living lab and enable concrete cooperation and translation of documents and dialogue.

- Potential for interaction with the local community (residents, staff, and other end users). Ideally the local authorities or developers have previous experience with community engagement and/or an explicit ambition to involve the local community in their ongoing projects.
- A strong architectural or urban environment that characterizes the space of the living lab, with good accessibility to the site and stakeholders, and good availability of data, physical documentation (photos, drawings) etcetera. (TRANS-URBAN-EU-CHINA, 2019)

In the following chapters we will evaluate the ULL activities under the framework of these identified success criteria.

### 1.2 ACTIVITIES IN THE ULL CITIES

WP5 organised living labs for the TRANS-URBAN project, with physical and virtual activities, in which Work Packages 1-4 can develop, test and refine their research together with local stakeholders:

- WP1 Community building and place-making in neighbourhoods
- WP2 Bridging the planning-implementation gap in eco- and smart cities
- WP3 Land use planning and land management
- WP4 Integrated transition pathways towards sustainable urban planning and governance

Those activities can be divided into different types:

**Expert Workshops** mostly took place at the beginning and at end of the project. The EU-China expert workshop on ULL at the beginning of the project served to sort out the theoretical development of ULL and the similarities and differences in the conceptual understanding of ULL between China and Europe. The insights and discussions of these experts helped us to develop an ULL implementation plan that could be adapted to the Chinese context. At the end of the project, we organized workshops with ULL experts from China and Europe in order to give each WP the opportunity to present their research results and get feedback from ULL experts and stakeholders. This feedback helped the WPs to revise their research results and to derive targeted policy recommendations. The professional exchange and mutual feedback between Chinese and European experts are important tools for knowledge innovation in sustainable urbanization in China and Europe.

**Knowledge Cafés** In collaboration with Work Package 4, we organized a series of knowledge cafés which created a place for project teams and Urban Living Lab city stakeholders to meet and interact with each other. The knowledge cafés, organized physically and virtually, acted as a venue for mutual understanding and discussion, empowering them to become a hub for ULL activities.

**Field Studies** China’s cities have different characteristics and challenges, so if we want to do specific research on a particular city, fieldwork is necessary. This is the conventional research method and the source to obtain research data. In this project, we combined field studies with other forms of activities such as expert workshops and knowledge cafés parallel with the field studies in order to provide a holistic image of the city.
**Summer Schools** are short-term courses that are deeply connected to the topics of the TRANS-URBAN project and hosted by ULL cities. Groups of students from different countries used ULL cities as case studies and members of the TRANS-URBAN project team participated as teachers in the teaching activities. The summer schools have become an important platform and tool for the project in education and dissemination of results.

**Placemaking Weeks** are important tools for sustainable urban development in improving the living environment and quality of life of urban residents. Nowadays, it is becoming more and more common to invite local residents to participate in projects in their neighborhood. Activities such as placemaking weeks can promote and publicize this consensus and demonstrate the positive impact of residents' involvement in project implementation, which has been one of the highlights of the activities in TRANS-URBAN Living Labs.

The abovementioned different types of activities build the full range of the idea of TRANS-URBAN Living Lab in practice in China. Each type of activity plays a different role and has a corresponding function. This allows the project team to understand and communicate with TRANS-Urban Living Labs, to form a collaborative innovation with the participation of multiple stakeholders, and to share and transfer the latest research progress to the relevant groups in a timely manner.

During the past three years, Work Package 5 has organized a series of events and activities in TRANS-Urban Living Labs (28 events in total) with the aim to enhance the collaboration between each work package of the project team and the TRANS-Urban Living Labs. This allowed for each work package to develop appropriate research methods, as well as confirm the details of the research topic and the content of the tests, according to their own WP’s needs and in the specific context of TRANS-Urban Living Labs. Despite the fact that the project team was unable to be physically present in TRANS-Urban Living Labs due to the COVID-19 pandemic in 2020, each work package interacted online with experts in TRANS-Urban Living Labs during the final phase to accomplish the expected research objectives and produce fruitful results.

### 1.3 THE URBAN LIVING LAB ACTIVITIES OVERVIEW

The interaction with multiple stakeholders of ULL cities in China is listed below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Events/activities</th>
<th>Event description/Time and place</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>UN-HABITAT Placemaking Week</td>
<td>Global gatherings of placemakers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>December 2018, Wuhan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>People Oriented Urban Public Space</td>
<td>Training course for students</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>8-9 December 2018, Wuhan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Wuhan Placemaking site visit</td>
<td>Guided site on historical street</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>placemaking</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>10 December 2018, Wuhan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Wuhan Placemaking week plenary session</td>
<td>Plenary session of the Placemaking</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Week</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>11 December 2018, Wuhan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Meeting with local stakeholders</td>
<td>meeting with the Shui On Land</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>group</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>11 December 2018, Wuhan</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

2 The more detailed description of the ULL activities can be found on TRANS-URBAN-EU-CHINA report: Deliverable 5.3 Urban Living Lab Transformative Knowledge which is available online: [http://transurbanechina.eu/fileadmin/user_upload/tuec/files/Deliverables/TRANS-URBAN-EU-CHINA_D5.3_NTNU.pdf](http://transurbanechina.eu/fileadmin/user_upload/tuec/files/Deliverables/TRANS-URBAN-EU-CHINA_D5.3_NTNU.pdf)
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>#</th>
<th>Event Title</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>UN-HABITAT Summer School</td>
<td>Innovation Summer School on rural revitalization 5-14 August 2019, Wuhan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Wuhan Living Lab Workshops</td>
<td>Study trip of WP2 and 3 November 2019, Wuhan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Wuhan University Workshop and Knowledge Café</td>
<td>Workshop with Wuhan University, Urban Innovation Lab 7 November 2019, Wuhan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>WLSP Workshop</td>
<td>Workshop with WLSP 8 November 2019, Wuhan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>WLSP Staff exchange to NTNU</td>
<td>WLSP spent 3 months at NTNU for training and cooperation January-March 2020, Trondheim</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Online interview with Wuhan University</td>
<td>COVID-19 lockdown &amp; its impact on inhabitants March 2020, Online</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>World Urban Forum Special Event for Wuhan</td>
<td>WUF-event to support Wuhan in its fight against COVID-19 February 2020, Wuhan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>EU-China Forum on Sustainable Urban Development</td>
<td>Meet and exchange ideas on sustainable urbanization 18 May 2018, Tianjin</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>Study Trip to Tianjin</td>
<td>Study trip to the Tianjin Port Free Trade Zone 19 October 2018, Tianjin</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>Tianjin Stakeholder Workshop</td>
<td>Joint workshop and Knowledge Café 17 May 2019, Tianjin</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>EU-China Forum on Sustainable Urban Development</td>
<td>Conference showcasing latest of Xiong’an New Area 12 December 2018, Xiong’an</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>Forbidden City Workshop with Jingdezhen Municipality</td>
<td>Jingdezhen as 2nd TRANS-URBAN-EU-CHINA Living Lab 3-7 September 2018, Beijing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>Study trip and Workshop in Jingdezhen</td>
<td>Workshop with local and regional decision makers 17-18 October 2018, Jingdezhen</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>International Forum and Workshop on Community Planning</td>
<td>Workshop with Community Building 29-30 August 2019, Wenjiang</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>International Community Urban Competition</td>
<td>urban design of 15 sites in Wenjiang August 2019, Chengdu</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td>Experts-Community Stakeholders’ Workshops</td>
<td>Three parallel experts-community workshops 31 August 2019, Wenjiang</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>EU-China experts online seminar series 1</td>
<td>Integrated transition pathways towards sustainable urban planning and governance – 3 July 2020 (online)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23</td>
<td>EU-China experts online seminar series 2</td>
<td>Bridge planning-implementation gap in eco &amp; smart cities 26 August 2020 (online)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
<td>Nordic Edge workshop: Urban living lab</td>
<td>Urban living labs used as instruments of open innovation 24 September 2020 (online)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25</td>
<td>EU-China experts online seminar series 3</td>
<td>How to make urban expansion more socially integrative 16 October 2020 (online)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26</td>
<td>EU-China experts online seminar series 4</td>
<td>How to make urban renewal socially integrative 19 October 2020 (online)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27</td>
<td>EU-China experts online seminar series 5</td>
<td>Community building 23 October 2020 (online)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
2 SUCCESS CRITERION 1: LOCAL ANCHORING, ROBUST CONTACT AND EXISTING COOPERATION

2.1 SCOPE

ULLs in TRANS-URBAN-EU-CHINA rely on the existing cooperation between Chinese consortium partners and local authorities and other stakeholders. This will help to build trust and increase TRANS-URBAN’s chances of getting involved in real-life urban transition projects. This will also help the project to establish a part-time local presence in the living lab and enable concrete cooperation and translation of documents and dialogue. (TRANS-URBAN-EU-CHINA, 2019)

2.2 ANALYSIS OF ULL ACTIVITIES

2.2.1 EU-CHINA FORUM ON SUSTAINABLE URBAN DEVELOPMENT (MAY 2018, May 2019)

The EU-China Forum on Sustainable Urban Development is held annually in Tianjin and is a result of the cooperation between project partners from China and Europe. The Forum established the ULL Tianjin as a key achievement. Using existing cooperation partners, we gained political anchoring at Tianjin municipality, and signed an agreement with Tianjin to announce Tianjin as one of the ULLs. We had several preparatory meetings with the local decision makers of the industry zone, during which we realised that there were different expectations of what a living lab would entail. It took several meetings and negotiations to get to a common definition of a challenge we could work with, after the contract had been signed. Following the agreement, we organized a workshop on-site with local stakeholders that worked and/or lived in the area. We connected the virtual community building tool “Community of Communities”, developed in WP4, to this event. All of the activities were facilitated by TRANS-URBAN partner CCUD’s local contacts. The local decision makers even provided us with a long-term physical space in which we could organise living lab activities. However, due to COVID-19, this space could not be used.

2.2.2 FORBIDDEN CITY WORKSHOP WITH JINGDEZHEN MUNICIPALITY (SEPTEMBER 2018) / STUDY TRIP AND WORKSHOP IN JINGDEZHEN (OCTOBER 2018)

There were very high expectations to Jingdezhen in the TRANS-URBAN ULL series because the establishment of the ULL was facilitated by TRANS-URBAN co-coordinator CAUPD, endorsed by the Governor of Jiangxi Province and witnessed by the Vice-Minister of Housing and Urban Rural Development and the Head of the EU delegation to China, during a special session organized in the Forbidden City. Jingdezhen is also a perfect city to TRANS-URBAN as it is facing the transition from an industrial city with a long history into an innovative and cultural-creative city. After the signing session in the Forbidden City, we had a very fruitful study trip to Jingdezhen, including formal meetings and brainstorming meetings with local and regional decision makers. However, after that, a political shift happened in the local authorities, and we have not been able to get in contact with Jingdezhen. The plan we made to organize a consortium meeting in Jingdezhen 2019 was also canceled.

2.2.3 UN-HABITAT PLACEMAKING WEEK IN WUHAN (DECEMBER 2018)

The Placemaking Week in Wuhan was organized by UN-Habitat, in cooperation with local decision makers and stakeholders, and international experts and students. The Placemaking Week formed a dual opportunity to strengthen the range of activities with local stakeholders in TRANS-URBAN-EU-
CHINA Living Lab Wuhan, as well as extended the project cooperation with UN-Habitat, a member of the Advisory Board of TRANS-URBAN-EU-CHINA. The theme of the Wuhan Placemaking Week (WPW) was “Shaping better public spaces: Remaking places – Transforming cities”. It was a unique opportunity to learn first-hand about current challenges and opportunities related to Wuhan development from professional urban planning experts and local communities.

These activities were combined with meetings with local real estate developers Shui on Land, a long-term cooperation partner of TRANS-URBAN-EU-CHINA partner CAS. In addition, during the Placemaking Week, we forged close connections with Wuhan University, which have contributed to strengthen the development of Wuhan as TRANS-URBAN Living Lab throughout the entire project period. With Wuhan as an important Living Lab for the TRANS-URBAN-EU-CHINA project, we even organized additional activities to support our local partners and to exchange experiential knowledge regarding the effect of COVID-19 on urban planning and local communities.

2.2.4 UN-HABITAT SUMMER SCHOOL IN WUHAN (AUGUST 2019)

The Summer School in Wuhan, organized the summer after the Placemaking Week, created a good framework for TRANS-URBAN partners to get familiar with the city, gather relevant data and get to know the stakeholders better. It also enabled us to create better local political anchoring with Wuhan Land Use and Spatial Planning Research Centre (WLSP), the municipal governmental agency whose support gave us access to data and provided contact with relevant stakeholders in the Wuhan ULL.

2.2.5 WUHAN LIVING LAB WORKSHOPS (NOVEMBER 2019)

Through the Placemaking Week and Summer School we had already established a strong connection with ULL Wuhan. In November of the same year, we followed up with field studies and workshops with local stakeholders. The Wuhan University Workshop was organized to meet local experts at the School of Design at Wuhan University, for an academic exchange of sustainable urbanization. We further organized a knowledge café with the students at Wuhan University, particularly emphasising the young generation’s experiences and feelings regarding Wuhan city. During a workshop with WLSP, we discussed the latest Wuhan Urban Master Planning (2020-2035).

2.2.6 OTHER TRANS-URBAN EXAMPLES

Jingdezhen, the second Urban Living Lab City of TRANS-URBAN, was supported by the Jiangxi Provincial Government at its inception and signed an agreement to establish Urban Living Lab in September 2018 in the presence of the EU Delegation and the Chinese Ministry of Housing and Urban-Rural Development. A month later the project team visited Jingdezhen. However, in the subsequent negotiations the project team encountered an inability to interface with specific local government departments such as the Planning Bureau and the Cultural Heritage Administration, which led to the shelving of the Urban Living Lab programme in Jingdezhen.

The ULL cities were established through the introduction and promotion of the Chinese partners of the project consortium. The Chinese partners had already established friendly relationships with these cities, which was one of the advantages for us when quickly establishing Urban Living Labs. For example, the establishment of Urban Living Lab in Tianjin was made possible through the efforts of CCUD, which has a good relationship with Tianjin and has successfully organized two Sino-European Sustainable Urban Development Forums (2018-2019) in Tianjin. Jingdezhen and Xiong’an New Area are in collaboration with CAUPD, with whom Jingdezhen has established a strategic partnership, and CAUPD is planning and implementing the construction of the Xiong’an New Area. Wuhan as an Urban Living Lab City came from the recommendation of CAS, and it was under their promotion that the project team established a good cooperation relationship in Wuhan. The community experiment in
Wenjiang, Chengdu was led by Tsinghua University, which invited the project consortium to participate in their practice in Wenjiang. These Chinese partners have been established directly with the local government. The Chinese partners have the important role of intermediaries in establishing Urban Living Labs.

Urban Living Lab Wuhan reached the best cooperation results with rich outcomes. A large part of the success is due to the principles of open innovation and quadruple helix well applied in Wuhan Urban Ling Lab activities. Work Package 5 joined Place Making Week in Wuhan 2018, during which we met a whole range of participants, i.e., governmental organizations, research community, international organizations, local industry, and invited them to participate in the formation of ULL. The 2019 summer school deepened the contacts with governmental organizations, research groups and students, followed by a research fieldwork in November 2019, two workshops and a Knowledge Café, all with an eye on diversity of participants and creating a co-innovation environment. As a result, Wuhan had the highest participation during the EU-China experts online seminar series in 2020.

2.3 RECOMMENDATIONS

Need for political anchoring and need for broad anchoring across several decision makers & stakeholders

The nature of the Chinese political decision-making system and the strict top-down governance structure of the administrative system result in the government’s overwhelmingly dominant role in the decision-making process. A prerequisite for seeking cooperation and exchange with cities, including the establishment of Urban Living Labs, is the approval and support of the municipal government. Therefore, even though Urban Living Lab activities require the participation and creation of all stakeholders, inviting the city government to join and getting the support of the local government is the most important step in Urban Living Lab activities, followed by a commitment regarding localization and concretization of activities in the community.

Multi-stakeholder participation and collaboration are key to completing the Urban Living Lab practice. After receiving support from the city government leadership, the stakeholders necessary for Work Packages need to be identified, and the process of identifying stakeholders often involves inviting specific government departments to join. The inclusion of these specific departments will support and enable the creation of a collaborative working group.

Building on existing long-term cooperation aligned with local DNA, local priorities and co-creation towards a shared goal

The most effective way to develop new cooperation projects with Chinese cities is by building on previous long-term collaboration and contacts. In order to ensure successful cooperation with Chinese cities, it is necessary to understand the local situation and recent urban development goals and priorities. These development goals and priorities are sometimes very much linked to the current policies of the Chinese government on urbanization. It is important to understand the latest national policies on urban development and the city’s own development goals and priorities from the beginning. Linking the direction and content of the cooperation to these policies and development plans will help to promote cooperation with cities.

In working with all TRANS-URBAN Living Labs several methods and approaches have been adopted for guiding the activities in ULLs. The overall method to guide the activities in ULL Cities is Open Innovation
2.0\(^3\) which in this context of “Successful co-creation of knowledge and solutions between public and private sector, citizens and academia in Living Labs, has the potential to generate social innovation, in which the stakeholders themselves help (re)shape their environment and trigger change” (Moulaert 2013). Under this framework, the project’s workshops as well as the other activities in TRANS-URBAN Living Labs ensured the cooperation among partners with the inputs from key local stakeholders that will ensure practicability of knowledge transformation to ULL cities.

Besides Open Innovation 2.0, the quadruple helix\(^4\) approach has also been applied in working with ULL cities. This can help the project to identify the various stakeholders in ULL city from public, private sector and civil society which formed a knowledge society. Co-created shared values are the approach for ensuring the local stakeholders to join the process of creating evidence-based knowledge. That required project partners to understand the context of TRANS-URBAN Living Labs, which sometimes also involve the knowledge exchange during the joint workshops. That will eventually lead to joint common aims and goals.

3 SUCCESS CRITERION 2: POTENTIAL FOR INTERACTION WITH LOCAL COMMUNITY

3.1 SCOPE

Potential for interaction with local community (residents, staff and other end users). Ideally the local authorities or developer has previous experience with community engagement and/or an explicit ambition to involve local community in their ongoing projects. (TRANS-URBAN-EU-CHINA 2019)

3.2 ANALYSIS OF ULL ACTIVITIES

3.2.1 STAKEHOLDERS WORKSHOP AND KNOWLEDGE CAFÉ IN TIANJIN (MAY 2019)

On 18 May 2019, the TRANS-URBAN-EU-CHINA team organized a joint workshop and knowledge café with representatives of the Free Trade Zone administration, with companies who have their branch offices in the Free Trade Zone and residents as well as expert representatives of JPI Urban Europe projects. During the initial meeting with the decision makers, a lot of time was spent on discussion what a living lab would entail, and how important the contact with the local stakeholders would be. Based on these initial discussions, we organized a knowledge café with local stakeholders and international experts, supported by the virtual Community of Communities tool developed in WP4.\(^5\) While the format of a knowledge café originally was unfamiliar for the participants, during this workshop, a lot of new information and ideas were brought forward. Unfortunately, the development of these ideas was not followed up further due to COVID-19 restrictions. In the Tianjin case, the connections with the local stakeholders were not developed enough in order to transfer to online workshops, and the cooperation was therefore paused.

3.2.2 WUHAN PLACEMAKING WEEK PLENARY SESSION (11 DECEMBER 2018)

---

\(^3\) Open Innovation 2.0 promotes iterative, nonlinear innovation processes between multiple stakeholders from the public and private sectors, academia and civic society, in new and sometimes blurred roles, compared to the more linear exchange of ideas between individual companies.

\(^4\) A quadruple helix describes the cooperation between the public and private sectors, research and civil society in a knowledge society.

\(^5\) More info about the CoC please visit: [https://intelligent-cities-community.com](https://intelligent-cities-community.com)
The Wuhan Declaration was launched, establishing that “Everyone has the right to live in a great place, and the right to make the place where they already live better”; commits to create connected and accessible spaces; create healthy places that encourage social support and interaction; support a community-based visioning process for public spaces and support innovative statutory planning and budgeting policies. This Declaration was supported by concrete activities during the Placemaking Week. In particular, discussions held on opportunities for including socially integrative measures in the projects of Wuhan Shui On, and how to cooperate on implementing these ideas in Wuhan as Urban Living Lab. This way of working was also continued in the Summer School of 2019, in which student groups worked with local communities in rural areas outside of Wuhan.

3.2.3 INTERNATIONAL FORUM AND WORKSHOP ON COMMUNITY PLANNING (AUGUST 2019)

Wenjiang District in Chengdu City was the last Chinese city to join the URBAN LIVING LAB programme of TRANS-URBAN. Wenjiang was not considered by the project team at the beginning, nor was it recommended by the Chinese partners. The project team was invited by Tsinghua University to attend the International Forum and Workshop on Community Planning TRANS-URBAN held in August 2019 in Wenjiang, Chengdu, and the project team and the organizers agreed that the community planning practices in Wenjiang were perfect for the project, especially to match Work Package 1. Wenjiang became a TRANS-URBAN Living Lab.

3.3 RECOMMENDATIONS

Mutual learning & storytelling

China and Europe share common goals for sustainable urban development. However, Chinese cities and European cities differ in terms of size, development stage and focus, government decision making processes, and opportunities and challenges faced by cities. There is a need for mutual understanding and communication between the two sides in the cooperation on sustainable urban development in cities. China’s rapid economic growth and strong policy implementation and efficiency have led to extremely rapid urban change, an amazing achievement that European cities can learn from. The European policy formulation and implementation process focuses on the interests of all stakeholders and seeks a gentle and gradual transition to sustainable smart cities, which also has a lot of lessons for China. During the implementation of WP 5, mutual learning and mutual reference were carried out throughout the cooperation of TRANS-Urban Living Labs. Storytelling can be used as an effective tool to build mutual trust and lower the threshold of understanding the research topic so that the participants can understand each other’s intentions correctly and reduce misunderstandings between the Chinese and the European parties.

4. SUCCESS CRITERION 3: A STRONG ARCHITECTURAL OR URBAN ENVIRONMENT THAT CHARACTERIZES THE SPACE OF THE LIVING LAB

4.1 SCOPE

A strong architectural or urban environment characterizes the space of the living lab, where the ULL will be with good accessibility to the site and stakeholders, and good availability of data, physical documentation (photos, drawings) etc. (TRANS-URBAN-EU-CHINA 2019)

4.1 ANALYSIS OF ULL ACTIVITIES

4.2.1 CHINA-EU CONFERENCE ON SUSTAINABLE URBANIZATION (DECEMBER 2018)
The development of the Xiong’an New Area was chosen as the core theme of the EU-China Conference on Smart City Development, hosted by CAUPD in December 2018. The construction of the Xiong’an New Area is of national significance and will support similar initiatives planned for the Shenzhen Special Economic Zone and the Shanghai Pudong New Area. Xiongan is an ongoing project, a new city under construction. Building new cities and areas has become quite popular since China got into a rapid urbanization in the 1990s. But Xiongan is also unique. This is the first time that the central government has decided to build a new city near Beijing for sharing some functions of the capital of China where the city is overloaded. After a few meetings, the cooperation did not advance to a more solid cooperation. This is due to several reasons. A first reason may be that Xiongan is a very new concept regarding urban development which in a sense is quite experimental, with top-down planning. For this reason, TRANS-URBAN experts had less space to make suggestions. The other reason is that TRANS-URBAN experts had limited access to the planning documents; most of the planning documents were confidential at the time, which made it difficult for TRANS-URBAN to understand how Xiongan would develop in the future.

4.2.2 WUHAN LIVING LAB ONLINE SEMINAR SERIES (JULY-OCTOBER 2020)

Several activities such as the 2020 experts-stakeholders workshop in Tianjin were canceled due to the worldwide COVID-19 outbreak. We have identified activities that were planned in a certain way and that needed adjustments when carried out during the pandemic. We analyzed whether they were successful after all (or not), what are the lessons learned from that, how the pandemic has affected the activities, and what are the inherent characteristics of activities that were successful despite the pandemic.

Due to the outbreak of COVID-19, TRANS-URBAN had to change the plan of visiting Wuhan in May 2020, and instead transform the workshops into six online seminars. The online workshops took the form of a professional exchange, and it was hard to involve local communities and citizens. We experienced an advantage of gathering participants from different places with low cost. We had six separate events instead of one workshop with physical presence, and we had more focus on academic work and research.

For the other ULLs, no digital alternatives were organized. Compared to the Wuhan ULL, the other ULLs were less developed in terms of number and types of relations with local stakeholders and proved difficult to continue without a physical presence.

In working with WP4 the Community of Communities is a virtual meeting place where the citizens and relevant stakeholders of ULL can meet the experts from TRANS-URBAN-EU-CHINA. The Community of Communities platform can also organize online events. Before the pandemic we executed a series of online activities with ULL cities. Through those CoC activities we gained the experiences of hosting online activities, which supported us in running ULL activities in 2020.

4.3 RECOMMENDATIONS

Virtual community building

Modern technology has bridged the gap between the project team and URBAN LIVING LAB’s urban stakeholders in terms of time and space. The virtual communication platform supported by digital technology allows URBAN LIVING LAB events to be held with continuity and permanence, especially in the area of community building where the advantages of the digital platform can be used to help citizens reach out to stakeholders from different countries. Especially in the COVID-19 period, the importance and advantages of the digital platform are highlighted, and the project team relies heavily on the digital platform for the collaboration with TRANS-Urban Living Labs in 2020. The virtual
community building can reach its best performance when it coexists with physical activities. Especially it can play as a virtual meeting place to follow up the physical events in ULLs.

5 CONCLUSION

This deliverable is built upon the previous work including D 5.2 ULLs knowledge base and D5.3 ULLs transformative knowledge. The deliverable aims to extract the recommendations for future ULL activities in China. In order to realize that, the deliverable has reexamined ULL practices and outcomes under the framework of success criteria:

- Local anchoring, robust contact and existing cooperation
- Potential for interaction with local community
- A strong architectural or urban environment that characterizes the space of the living lab

During the implementation of the TRANS-URBAN Living Labs, we have gained some important experiences and lessons.

Many uncertainties in the Urban Living Lab activities have led to challenges and created opportunities in the implementation phase. These uncertainties are mainly related to the different understanding of the same concept between China and Europe, the lack of understanding of China’s urban development and the national context, the vertical top-down governance system of Chinese cities and the impact of new policies issued by Chinese Government, etc.

The way to deal with these uncertainties is to plan with flexibility. Contingency plans need to be developed for unexpected situations in order to overcome the difficulties caused by unexpected situations and also to seize the opportunities presented by the uncertainties. It needs to take uncertainty into account and to allow for adjustments in the implementation of the plan of action. We believe that sharing these experiences and lessons learned will help future similar practices in China.
REFERENCES


